The Report of the GAIN/LOSS ANALYSIS OF FINANCIAL EXPERIENCE During calendar 1982 Moorhead Fire Department Relief Association Moorhead, Minnesota

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| Pages | Item |
|-------|--|
| 1 | Signature Page |
| 2 | Purpose of Gain/Loss Analysis |
| 3 | Activity Which Results in Gains or Losses |
| 4 | Composite Results of Gain/Loss Analysis 1982 |
| 5 | 1979 thru 1981 |
| 6 | Schedule of Active Employees |
| 7 | Comparative Schedule of Active Members |
| 8 | Schedule of Separations From Active Service (Withdrawal) |
| 9 | Schedule of Separations From Active Service (Death & Disability) |
| 10 | Schedule of Age & Service Retirement |
| 11 | Schedule of Death After Retirement |
| 12 | Comments |

Appendices

Valuation Methods and Assumptions Summary of Benefit Provisions

GABRIEL, ROEDER, SMITH & COMPANY

ACTUARIES & CONSULTANTS

2090 First National Building Detroit, Michigan 48226 Area 313: 961-3346

June 2, 1983

Board of Trustees Moorhead Fire Department Relief Association Moorhead, Minnesota

<u>Submitted in this report</u> are the results of the 1982 <u>gain/loss analysis</u> of the financial experiences of the Moorhead Fire Department Relief Association.

The <u>composite results</u> of this study are reported on Schedule 1, and comments regarding the results are on page 12.

The gain/loss analysis was based upon statistical data furnished by the Association regarding active and retired member changes and related financial transactions.

The actuarial assumptions used for regular valuation purposes and which produce "expected" experience data are shown in the appendix of this report. A brief summary of the Association's benefits is also included in the appendix.

Respectfully submitted,

Judlay Gary 0'Keefe

PURPOSE OF GAIN/LOSS ANALYSIS

Actual financial experience will not coincide exactly with assumed financial experience--differences are to be expected since the future cannot be predicted with absolute precision. The changes in computed liabilities resulting from differences between actual and assumed experiences are called <u>actuarial gains</u>, if the experience was financially favorable and <u>actuarial losses</u>, if the experience was financially unfavorable. Actuarial gains result in decreases in contribution rates and actuarial losses result in increases.

Regular actuarial valuations provide information about aggregate computed liabilities. However, regular valuations do not develop the information needed to explain the year to year changes in computed liabilities attributable to each activity within the retirement system financial mechanism. <u>The purpose of a gain/loss analysis</u> is to determine the change in computed liabilities and contribution rates attributable to variations between actual and assumed experience.

Once a difference between actual and assumed experience in a risk area has been observed to be sizeable and persistent, the assumed experience should be changed to reflect the observed reality. However, gains and losses over a relatively short period of time may not be indicative of long term trends which provide the basis for selection of actuarial assumptions.

-2-

ACTIVITY WHICH RESULTS IN GAINS OR LOSSES

Age & Service Retirement.

If members retire at older ages than assumed, there is a gain. If retirements occur at younger ages than assumed there is a loss.

Disability & Death-in-Service.

If casualty claims are less than assumed, there is a gain. If there are more casualty losses than assumed, there is a loss.

Withdrawal.

If more liabilities are released by withdrawal than assumed, there is a gain.

If there are fewer withdrawals than assumed, there is a loss.

Salary Increases.

If there are smaller salary increases than assumed, there is a gain.

If salary increases are greater than assumed, there is a loss.

Investment Income.

If there is greater investment income than assumed, there is a gain.

If investment income is less than assumed, there is a loss.

Post Retirement Mortality.

If benefit recipients die at younger ages than assumed, there is a gain. If they live longer than assumed, there is a loss.

Contribution.

Gains or losses arise due to the delay in implementing changes in the recommended contribution.

Miscellaneous.

Miscellaneous gains and losses include changes due to data adjustments, rounding and changes in the average age and service characteristics of the group.

Schedule 1.

Gains & Losses in Accrued Liabilities and Changes in Contribution Requirements During Calendar 1982

| Type of Activity | <u>(Gain</u> Active Members | d Liabilities) or Loss * Retirants & <u>Beneficiaries</u> in 1,000) | Contribution Requirements (Gain) or Loss * Normal Cost \$ Payment % of Payroll on UAL (\$ in 1,000) (0.01)% \$(0.4) | | | |
|--|-----------------------------------|--|--|-----------------|--|--|
| Age & Service Retirements | \$ (5.2) | \$ N/A | (0.01)% | \$(0.4) | | |
| Disability & Death-in-Service | | | | | | |
| a. Disability | (5.7) | N/A | (0.01) | (0.4) | | |
| b. Death-in Service | (5.7) | N/A | 0.00 | (0.4) | | |
| Withdrawal | (34.6) | N/A | 0.00 | (2.3) | | |
| Salary Increases | (118.6) | 0.0 | N/A | (7.9) | | |
| Investment Income | (65.8) | (127,9) | N/A | (12.9) | | |
| Post Retirement Mortality | N/A | 26.9 | N/A | 1.8 | | |
| Contribution | 105.1 | 0.0 | N/A | 7.0 | | |
| Miscellaneous | (494.2) | (1.3) | (5.56) | (<u>33.0</u>) | | |
| EXPERIENCE RELATED (GAIN)/LOSS & CORRESPONDING CHANGE IN CONTRIBUTION REQUIREMENTS | \$(624.7) | \$(102.3) | (5.58)% | \$(48.5) | | |
| Changes due to plan amendments | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | | |
| TOTAL (GAIN)/LOSS DURING YEAR | \$(624.7) | \$(102.3) | (5.58)% | \$(48.5) | | |

* Accrued liabilities and contribution requirements are affected by gains and losses. Gains result in reductions in both and losses result in increases in both.

Schedule 2.

Gains & Losses in Accrued Liabilities From January 1, 1979 thru December 31, 1981

| Type of Activity | Accruec (Gair Active Members | 9 - 12/31/79 1 Liabilities 1) or Loss Retirants & Beneficiaries 1 1,000) | Accrued (Gain) Active Members B | - 12/31/80 Liabilities or Loss Retirants & Geneficiaries 1,000) | Accrued (Gain) Active Members B | - 12/31/81 Liabilities or Loss Retirants & eneficiaries 1,000) |
|--|---------------------------------------|---|--|--|--|---|
| Age & Service Retirements | \$ 0.0 | \$ N/A | \$ (0.7) | \$ N/A | \$ 31.0 | \$ N/A |
| Disability & Death-in-Service | | | | | | |
| a. <u>Disability</u> | (3.4) | N/A | (3.6) | N/A | (4.2) | N/A |
| b. Death-in Service | 2.9 | N/A | 1.9 | N/A | 2.9 | N/A |
| Withdrawal | (16.4) | N/A | 9.7 | N/A | 16.3 | N/A |
| Salary Increases | 79.7 | 0.0 | 103.4 | 0.0 | 373.0 | 0.0 |
| Investment Income | (14.5) | (6.5) | (14.2) | (8.1) | (52 <mark>.2</mark>) | 2.1 |
| Post Retirement Mortality | N/A | 6.8 | N/A | 10.5 | N/A | 11.9 |
| Contribution | 34.6 | 24.1 | (16.1) | (10.6) | (5.0) | 67.2 |
| Miscellaneous | 0.2 | (0.5) | 0.0 | 0.0 | 97.8 | 0.5 |
| EXPERIENCE RELATED (GAIN)/LOSS | \$83.1* | \$23.9 | \$ 80.4 | \$(8.2) | \$459.6 | \$81.7 |
| Method Change for Casualty Cost | | | 37.0 | | | |
| Changes Due to Plan Amendments | 0.0 | 0.0 | 681.6 | 0.0 | 331.3 | 13.0 |
| TOTAL (GAIN)/LOSS DURING PREVIOUS 3 YEAR PERIOD | \$83.1* | \$23.9 | \$799.0 | \$(8.2) | \$790.9 | \$94.7 |

* These amounts are based upon the revised valuation results.

5-

Schedule 3.

Employees Active at Both Beginning & End of 1982

| Age Group Beg. Year | No. | Beginning Salary | Ending Salary | % Increase In Salary |
|---------------------------|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------|
| 25-29 30-34 35-39 | 1 5 10 | \$ 20,156 96,393 203,350 | \$ 20,222 93,571 204,952 | 0.3 % (2.9) 0.8 |
| 40-44 45-49 50-54 | 5 6 1 | 105,915 146,485 27,120 | 107,319 148,919 25,091 | 1.3 1.7 (7.5) |
| 60-64 | _1 | 27,120 | 27,120 | 0.0 |
| TOTALS | 29 | \$626,539 | \$627,194 | 0.1% |

Employees Active at Either Beginning or End of 1982

| | | and and a second se |
|---|----------------------------------|--|
| | | τ. |
| Years Service 0 1 2 3 4 | Beginning <u>of Year</u> 1 | End of Year |
| 5 or more | 30 | 29 |

Average Age: 40.9 years.

Average Service: 15.1 years.

Schedule 4.

Comparative Schedule

Of Active Members

| Valuation Date | | Valuation | Average | | | | |
|-------------------|----------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|----------|---------|--|
| December 31 | Active Members | Payroll | Age | Service | Pay | % Incr. | |
| 1978 | 33 | \$531,714 | 37.3 yrs. | 11.8 yrs. | \$16,113 | - % | |
| 1979 | 33 | 569,147 | 38.2 | 12.6 | 17,247 | 7.0 | |
| 1980 | 33 | 617,850 | 39.2 | 13.6 | 18,723 | 8.6 | |
| 1981 | 31 | 671,035 | 39.2 | 13.5 | 21,646 | 15.6 | |
| 1982 | 29 | 627,194 | 40.9 | 15.1 | 21,627 | 0.0 | |

Schedule 5.

Separations From Active Service Due to Withdrawal

During Four Year Period Ended December 31, 1982

| Age at Termination | Actua | 1979 1 Expected | Actual | 1980 Expected | Actual | 1981 Expected | The second se | 1982 Expected |
|----------------------------------|-------|------------------------|--------|-------------------|--------|-------------------|---|------------------|
| 20-24 25-29 30-34 35-39 | 1 | * 0.1 0.1 0.2 | | 0.1 0.1 0.2 | | 0.1 0.1 0.1 | 1 1 | * 0.1 0.1 |
| 40-44 45-49 | | * | | * | | * | | 0.1 |
| Totals | 1 | 0.4 | 0 | 0.4 | 0 | 0.4 | 2 | 0.3 |

Total actual during four year period 3Total expected during four year period 1.5

| Years Service at Termination | ervice at 1979 | | | | | 1981 Expected | 1982 Actual Expected | | |
|------------------------------------|----------------|-----|---|-----|---|------------------|-------------------------|-----|--|
| 0 1 2 3 4 | | 0.1 | | 0.1 | | * | 1 | * | |
| 5 or more | 1 | 0.3 | | 0.3 | | 0.3 | _1 | 0.3 | |
| Totals | 1 | 0.4 | 0 | 0.4 | 0 | 0.4 | 2 | 0.3 | |
| | | | | | | | | | |

* Less than 0.1%

Schedule 6.

Separations From Active Service Due to Death and Disability

During Four Year Period Ended December 31, 1982

Death Separations

| | | | | al a sub an | | | | |
|----------------------------|--------|------------------|--------|---|------|----------------------|-------|--------------------|
| Age at Time of Death | Actual | 1979 Expected | Actual | 1980 Expected | Actu | 1981 Jal Expected | Actua | 1982 I Expected |
| 25-29 | | * | | * | | | | |
| 30-34 | | * | | * | | * | | * |
| 35-39 | | 0.1 | | * | | * | | * |
| 40-44 | | * | | 0.1 | | * | | * |
| 45-49 | | * | | | | | | × |
| <mark>50-5</mark> 4 | | * | | * | | * | | |
| Totals | 0 | 0.1 | 0 | 0.1 | 0 | 0.1 | 0 | 0.1 |

Total actual during four year period 0Total expected during four year period 0.4

- 1

Disability Separations

| Age at Time of Disability | Description of the second seco | 979 Expected | Actual | 1980 Expected | | 1981 Expected | Actual | 1982 Expected | |
|---------------------------------|--|-----------------|--------|------------------|---|------------------|--------|------------------|--|
| 25-29 | | * | | * | | | | | |
| 30-34 | | * | | * | | * | | * | |
| 35-39 | | 0.1 | | * | | * | | * | |
| 40-44 | | * | | 0.1 | | * | | * | |
| 45-49 | | * | | * | | * | | * | |
| Totals | 0 | 0.1 | 0 | 0.1 | 0 | 0.1 | 0 | 0.1 | |

Total actual during four year period 0Total expected during four year period 0.4

Schedule 7.

Separations From Active Service For Age & Service Retirement

| Age at Termination | n Actual | 1979 Expected | Actua | 1980 1 Expected | | 1981 Expected | Actua | 1982 1 Expected |
|-----------------------|----------|------------------|-------|--------------------|---|------------------|-------|--------------------|
| 54 | | | | | 1 | | | |
| 55 59 | | | | 1.0 | 1 | | | |
| 60 61 | _ | | | | | 1.0 | - | 1.0 |
| TOTALS | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 1.0 | 2 | 1.0 | 0 | 1.0 |

Average age at retirement during period examined was 55.0 years. Average service at retirement during period examined was 31.0 years.

Schedule 8.

Death After Retirement (Disability and Service Retirants)

| Age at Death | and a state of the | 979 Expected | and the second sec | .980 Expected | 1 | | 1981 Expected | and the second se | 1982 Expected |
|-----------------|--|-----------------|--|------------------|---|---|------------------|---|------------------|
| 50-54 | | 0.0132 | | | | | 0.0132 | | |
| 55-59 | | | | 0.0142 | | | 0.0296 | | 0.0462 |
| 60-64 | | | | | | | 0.0217 | | 0.0237 |
| 65-69 | | 0.1225 | | 0.0846 | | | 0.0438 | | |
| 70-74 | | 0.1013 | | 0.1560 | | | 0.2148 | | 0.2102 |
| 75-79 | | 0.1674 | | 0.0795 | | | 0.0863 | | 0.1609 |
| 80-84 | - | | | 0.1026 | | | 0.1126 | . <u> </u> | 0.1235 |
| TOTALS | 0 | 0.4044 | 0 | 0.4369 | | 0 | 0.5220 | 0 | 0.5655 |

Total actual during four year period <u>0</u>

Total expected during four year period 1.9288

COMMENTS

Economic Assumptions and Financing Method

The economic assumptions of 5% annual investment return and 3 1/2% annual salary increases are established by state law. State law also specifies that the annual minimum obligation of the municipality shall be determined by adding (i) the employer normal cost percent times covered payroll to (ii) the <u>level dollar</u> amount required to amortize the unfunded accrued liability by December 31, 2010.

Over the past few years, both the actual rates of salary increase and investment return have generally exceeded the assumed rates, resulting in increases in the dollar amount of unfunded accrued liabilities. If the financial experiences of recent years persist, and the economic assumptions and financing method are not changed, it is reasonable to expect that unfunded accrued liabilities will increase in actual dollar amount for a number of years. This is true even though a level dollar amortization schedule is being followed. Accordingly, it is reasonable to expect that under the described conditions the actual dollar contributions required to make amortization payments will increase for a number of years. On the other hand, if inflation subsides and actual economic activity approaches assumed experience, it is reasonable to expect the dollar amount of the contribution to amortize the unfunded accrued liability to remain relatively constant. The notion that amortization dollar amounts may be increasing is not necessarily cause for alarm. If adjusted for changes in purchasing power, any future increases in the dollar contributions may or may not reflect increases in terms of real dollars (inflation adjusted dollars).

It is also worth noting that when the same assumptions and methods are applied to plans which differ in nature, the valuation results may not be comparable (for example, it is currently not valid to compare valuation results for a plan having full escalation to valuation results for a plan having a 3 1/2% cap on escalation.) Caution should be exercised when attempting to assess the financial condition of one Association relative to another on the basis of valuation results produced using the assumptions and methods mandated by state law.

Change in Methods

The amounts shown in the miscellaneous category primarily reflect a change in the method of valuing the spouses benefit.

APPENDICES

Valuation Methods and Assumptions

The Entry Age Normal Cost method was used to determine the normal cost of all benefits.

The rate of investment return (interest) used in making the valuation was 5.0 percent per annum, compounded annually. State law requires use of this assumption.

<u>The mortality table</u> used was the United States Life Table, 1959-61, White Males and White Females.

| Sample Ages | The second s | Single Lif sent Value vel Life Women | of \$1 Mont Increa | and the second se | Future <u>Expectanc</u> Men | | |
|----------------|--|--|-----------------------|---|-----------------------------------|-------|--|
| 45 | \$169.61 | \$186.84 | \$263.23 | \$304.86 | 27.33 | 32.52 | |
| 50 | 154.85 | 174.20 | 229.51 | 270.80 | 23.22 | 28.08 | |
| 55 | 139.29 | 159.62 | 197.24 | 236.11 | 19.45 | 23.81 | |
| 60 | 122.79 | 142.73 | 166.26 | 200.76 | 16.01 | 19.69 | |
| 65 | 106.31 | 124.22 | 137.82 | 166.16 | 12.97 | 15.88 | |
| 70 | 89.86 | 104.31 | 111.71 | 132.82 | 10.29 | 12.38 | |
| 75 | 73.39 | 83.92 | 87.66 | 101.94 | 7.92 | 9.28 | |
| 80 | 57.54 | 64.24 | 66.29 | 74.77 | 5.89 | 6.67 | |

00 57.54 04.24 00.29 74.77 5.09 0.

Age & service retirement was assumed to occur at age 58, or attained age if older.

Sample Rates of Separation From Active Employment Before Retirement, Death or Disability

| Sample | % of Active Members |
|--------|-----------------------------|
| Ages | Separating Within Next Year |
| 20 | 3.00% |
| 25 | 2.50 |
| 30 | 2.00 |
| 35 | 1.50 |
| 40 | 1.00 |
| 45 | 0.50 |
| 50+ | 0.00 |

| Sample _Ages | Present Pay Resulting in Pay of \$1,000 at Age 60 | Percent Increase in Pay During Next Year |
|-----------------|---|--|
| 20 | \$ 253 | 3.5% |
| 25 | 300 | 3.5 |
| 30 | 356 | 3.5 |
| 35 | 423 | 3.5 |
| 40 | 503 | 3.5 |
| 45 | 597 | 3.5 |
| 50 | 709 | 3.5 |
| 55 | 842 | 3.5 |
| 60 | 1,000 | 3.5 |

Pay Adjustment Factor used to Project Current Pays

Use of the pay adjustment factor illustrated above is required by state law.

Disability retirements were assumed to occur as indicated below:

| Sample Ages | % of Active Membe Disabled Within | |
|----------------------------|---|--|
| 20 25 30 35 40 | 0.08% 0.08 0.08 0.08 0.08 0.20 | |
| 45 50 55 | 0.26 0.49 0.89 | |

Brief Summary (12/31/82) of Benefit Provisions Evaluated and/or Considered

Full Paid Firemen

Age & Service Retirement

Eligibility. 20 years of service and 55 years of age.

<u>Amount</u>. For first 20 years of service, 50% of "final average salary". For each year in excess of 20 an additional 2% is added up to a maximum of 80% at 35 years of service. The benefit is then increased by an amount equal to 3% of final average salary.

Final Average Salary means the average salary earned during the last 5 years of employment on which contributions were made.

Disability Retirement

Eligibility. Totally and permanently disabled to the extent that no longer able to perform the duties of a firefighter before being eligible for age & service retirement.

<u>Amount</u>. Same as age & service benefit assuming 20 years service and 55 years of age. If less than 5 years service, final average salary is based on actual service to the time of the disability.

Member's Death While Active, Or In Deferred Status, Or Retired

Eligibility.

<u>Spouse</u>. Legally married to member at separation from service and residing with member at time of death. Benefits terminate upon remarriage.

<u>Child</u>. Younger than age 18 or, if full time student, younger than 22. Amount.

Spouse. 30% of average monthly salary for six months preceeding separation from service.

Child. 1/3 of spouse benefit per child.

Maximum Family Benefit. \$5,400 per year.

<u>Vested Deferred</u>. 10 years of service and separated before age 55. Payment beginning is deferred to attainment of eligibility for age & service retirement had active membership continued. Benefit of 2 1/2% of final average salary times years of service with maximum of 50% of final average salary.

<u>Post Retirement Adjustments ("Escalator")</u>. Benefit payments to retired members and beneficiaries are increased each January by the lesser of the following percentages: (1) 3 1/2% or (2) the preceeding year's percentage increase in the salary of a first grade firefighter.

<u>Member Contributions</u>. 8% of salary. Total member contributions are refundable, with 3% interest, compounded annually, if no monthly benefit is payable upon separation from service. (No member contributions are made beyond 35 years of service.) Funeral Expenses. \$1,000 lump sum payment upon death of active or retired member.

Volunteer Firemen

Age & Service Retirement

Eligibility. 20 years of service and 60 years of age.

Amount. \$576 per year.

Disability Retirement

<u>Eligibility</u>. Totally and permanently disabled to the extent that no longer able to perform the duties of a firefighter before being eligible for age & service retirement. (Must be duty related.)

Amount. \$480 per year.

Member's Death While Active, Or In Deferred Status, Or Retired

Eligibility. Same as full paid firemen.

Amount.

Spouse. \$480 per year.

Child. \$180 per year.

Funeral Expenses. \$500 lump sum payment upon death of active or retired member.

<u>Vested Deferred</u>. 4 years of service and separated before age 60. Payment beginning is deferred to attainment of age for eligibility for age & service retirement had active membership continued. Benefit is \$12 per year for each year of service with maximum of \$480 per year.

<u>Post Retirement Adjustment ("Escalator")</u>. Benefit payments to retired members are increased each January by the lesser of the following percentages: (1) 3 1/2% or (2) the preceeding year's percentage increase in the salary of a first grade fire-fighter.

<u>Member Contributions</u>. \$1 per month for up to 20 years of service. No contributions for service beyond 20 years.