

## 08 - 0085

Senator Mee Moua Minnesota State Senate 120 State Capitol Building 75 Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. Saint Paul, MN 55155 Representative Joe Mullery MN House of Representatives 367 State Office Building 100 Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. Saint Paul, MN 55155

Dear Senator Moua and Representative Mullery:

The Minnesota Department of Human Rights (MDHR) submits its semi-annual report to the Legislature summarizing the results of its investigation and resolution of human rights complaints. Documents detailing the Department's activities during the period of July 1, 2007 to December 31, 2007 are attached. Highlights of complaint activity are as follows:

- The number of new charges filed decreased 10% from the previous six-month period.
- MDHR closed 411 cases.
- The average time from filing a charge to issuing a determination of no probable cause was 449 days. The average time from filing a charge to issuing a determination of probable cause was 429 days.

On December 31 there were 27 cases in inventory older than 1 year. This overage was due to lost production hours for employee separations, leaves of absences and cross-training hours.<sup>1</sup>

- 29% of dismissals were accomplished within six months of the charge-filed date.
- The average caseload per enforcement officer during this report period decreased from 32 to 28.
- In total, MDHR recovered approximately \$235,000 for charging parties.

Highlights of alternative dispute resolution (ADR) are as follows:

- 162 cases pending determination were referred to ADR.
- 94% of all cases designated for investigation this report period were first referred to ADR.
- Mediations were conducted for 37 cases, resulting in 17 resolutions during this report period.
- MDHR recovered approximately \$222,050 for charging parties via its ADR program.

In addition to MDHR's excellent level of performance, during this reporting period the Department developed workforce planning strategies to take into consideration the potential of 25% eligible staff retirements by 2011 and implemented a Department-wide cross-training program.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Minnesota Department of Human Rights is anticipating losing approximately 10% of its workforce to retirements within the next two years. The staff will be replaced, however great deal on institutional knowledge will be lost. During the most recent reporting period the department implemented a department wide cross training program as one of its workforce planning strategies.

January 16, 2008 Page Two

If you have any questions or concerns, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yours truly,

zbl 6

Velma J. Korbel Commissioner

VK/dmrz

Enclosure

C: Beth Kadoun, Senior Policy Advisor Legislative Reference Library

### MINNESOTA DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

CASE MANAGEMENT SUMMARY REPORT

Report Period: July 1, 2007-December 31, 2007

CASE ACTIVITY	July 1, 2007—	January 1, 2007-	Change
	December 31, 2007	June 30, 2007	(Percent)
New Charges Filed	384 charges	427 charges	-10%
% of, above, still awaiting determination	74%	76%	-3%
Total # Cases <u>Closed</u> /Disposition %	411 cases	476 cases	-14%
Dismissed: Lack of Merit	47%	41%	+15%
Dismissed: other, incl. Lack of Cooperation	15%	23%	-35%
Withdrawn (excludes settled cases)	-5%	. 4%	+25%
Closed after Probable Cause (PC)	4%	6%	-33%
Closed after No Probable Cause (NPC)	21%	22%	-5%
Closed after split (PC/NPC) determination	1%	1%	0%
Pre-determination Resolution*	2%	2%	0%
ADR-resolved (settled/withdrawn)	5%	1%	+400%
Avg. # days to issue PROBABLE CAUSE	429 days/	325 days/	+32%
determination/Number issued	31 PC cases	30 PC cases	+3%
CAvg. # days to issue PC/NPC (split)	478 days/	344 days/	+39%
determination/Number issued	4 PC/NPC cases	9 PC/NPC cases	-56%
Avg. # days to issue NO PROBABLE CAUSE	449 days/	352 days/	+28%
determination/Number issued	91 NPC cases	105 NPC cases	-13%
Avg. <b># days to issue dismissal</b>	249 days	143 days	+74%
% of DWR Dismissals within 6 months	29%	77%	-62%
Avg. # Cases per fte Enforcement Officer	28 cases	32 cases	-13%

\* Includes predetermination settlements (PDS) and non-ADR withdrawals due to satisfactory resolution.

<b>INVENTORY:</b> Cases Pending, as of:	December 31, 2007	<u>June 30, 2007</u>
Cases needing initial determination:	476	534
Probable Cause cases:		

Conciliation status with Attorney General: 90

Administrative review requested by party:

14 cases pending (65 requests) 2 c

Post-determination cases:

2 cases pending (53 requests)

75

### Pre-determination Inventory, by Case Age (# days from filing, less tolling):

### Case count and percentage of inventory, as of

	December 31, 20	<u>07</u> :		<u>June 30, 2007:</u>		
	1 – 90 days:	188	39.5%	1 – 90 days:	199	37.3%
	91 – 180 days:	112	· 23.5%	91 – 180 days:	135	25.3%
	181 – 270 days:	74	15.6%	181 – 270 days:	124	23.2%
	271 – 365 days:	75	15.8%	271 – 365 days:	76	14.2%
-	366 or more days:	27	<u>5.7%</u>	<u>366 or more days</u>	: 0	0.0%
	Total:	476	100%	Total:	534	100%

### Entire Inventory, by Case Status, as of December 31, 2007:

### Pre -determination cases:

Initial Inquiry:	178	Remand Inv./Negotiations:	1
Case Screening:	62	NPC/Split Appeal Period:	21
Investigation:	192	Attorney General's Office:	90
PDS Pending:	5	OAH (180-day hearing):	0
Determination Revie	ew: 19	Remand Review	0
ADR:	16	Appeal/Reopen Pending:	14
Withdrawal Pending	: 4	Total:	126
Total:	476		

# MINNESOTA DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RIGHTS ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION (ADR) PROGRAM

### Report Period: July 1, 2007—December 31, 2007

### ADR Program activity:

**Number of cases referred to ADR from Enforcement Inventory:** 162 (This is 42% of the *number* of charges filed during period.)

53 of the cases referred to ADR were *filed* during the July 1, through December 31, 2007, report period. (This is 13 % of all charges filed during the period.\*)

94% of all cases designated for investigation this report period were first referred to ADR.

### **ADR Case activity**, 7/1/07—12/31/07:

Mediation held; resolved & closed:

Invitation *declined* by one or both parties; case returned to Investigation Unit: 87 cases

Both parties accepted ADR invitation: 28 cases

19 cases (avg. of 65 days in ADR status)

Mediation held; awaiting withdrawal: 0 case Mediation/s held; no agreement: 20 cases

Mediation cancelled; no agreement: 3 cases

#### ADR inventory, as of 12/31/07:

Awaiting response to ADR invitation:	4 cases
Mediation being scheduled:	2 cases
Mediation session scheduled:	10 cases
Resolved/awaiting withdrawal:	0 case
Total:	16 cases

Cases are typically sent directly to ADR after the answer and rebuttal are received and the case has been screened for merit, which generally occurs between three and six months from the filing date; however, if the parties are interested, cases under investigation also may be referred to mediation.

## MINNESOTA DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

Settlement Summary				
Closure Date of July 1, 2007, to December 31, 2007				
Summary by Settlement Type:				
Settlement Term	Total(s) #'s	Total(s) \$'s		
Back Wages/Pay	1	\$34,178.00		
Combined CP/Attorney Award	1	\$8,000.00		
Conduct Training	7	\$0.00		
CP Attorney Fees	2	\$15,209.18		
CP Damages Awarded	5	\$99,112.82		
AG's Legal Fees/Court Costs	2	\$2,000		
Implement Policy Change	7	\$0.00		
Other, Monetary	2	\$65,000.00		
Civil Penalties	.1	\$10,000.00		
Send Letter or Other Positive Reference	3	\$0.00		
Terms Confidential	16	\$222,050.00		
Unspecified Lump Sum	1	\$1,500.00		
Other, Non-monetary	2	\$0.00		
Total	50	\$457,050.00		
Summary by Closure Type:				
Closure Type				
ADR	13	\$222,050.00		
Conciliation Settlements	20	\$151,500.00		
Withdrawal - Satisfactorily Adjusted	2	\$1,500.00		
Litigation	15	\$82,000.00		
Total		\$457,050.00		
Fotal number of cases with reported se	ttlements:	50		